



THE NETWORK
OF MAJOR
EUROPEAN
CITIES

EUROCITIES Peer Review Report

Employability of Roma

EUROCITIES

EUROCITIES is the network of major European cities. Founded in 1986, the network brings together the local governments of over 130 large cities in some 34 European countries. EUROCITIES represents the interests of its members and engages in dialogue with the European institutions across a wide range of policy areas affecting cities. These include: economic development, the environment, transport and mobility, social affairs, culture, the information and knowledge society, and services of general interest.

EUROCITIES website: www.eurocities.eu

CONTENTS

1. Introduction.....	3
2. Background of the Roma employability projects	3
3. Benchmarking Roma employability projects in Glasgow	5
3.1 Relevance	5
3.2 Project design	5
3.3 Budget	6
3.4 Efficiency	6
3.5 Effectiveness	7
3.6 Outcomes/Impact.....	7
3.7 Sustainability	8
4. Conclusions and recommendations	9
4.1 The wider approach to Roma inclusion	9
4.2 Recommendations for developing Glasgow's approach to employability of Roma	10
ANNEX I: Methodological note and wider policy context in Glasgow	12
ANNEX II: Lessons for other cities looking to implement Roma employability schemes	15

This report was produced by Ann Morton Hyde in cooperation with members of the EUROCIITIES task force on Roma inclusion and Ana Feder from EUROCIITIES Brussels office.

We want to thank Glasgow City Council for hosting and coorganising this meeting with support from the Open Society Foundations.

1. INTRODUCTION

Lack of employment and high levels of unemployment are prevalent throughout Roma communities in Europe. This is a major factor of social and economic exclusion not only for Roma communities but for other ethnic minority groups with high concentrations of unemployed people.

While Glasgow city council has a long history of successfully implementing employment and training projects for many excluded and disadvantaged groups, its experience with Roma communities is more recent. In the last seven years Glasgow has seen an increase in the numbers of Roma families arriving in the city from Slovakia and Romania. While some have managed to find employment many Roma adults are unemployed and unable to find work except in the informal labour market.

This report presents the findings of the EUROCITIES peer review on employability of Roma in Glasgow. The peer review took place on 18-19 June 2013 and looked at three employment and training projects implemented in Glasgow by the Jobs and Business Agency (formerly known as Glasgow Regeneration Agency) an external organisation (ALEO) of Glasgow city council. The projects focused on:

- providing training
- developing relevant skills
- creating employment opportunities for Roma residents

2. BACKGROUND OF THE ROMA EMPLOYABILITY PROJECTS

The EUROCITIES peer review focused on projects providing training, developing relevant skills and creating employment opportunities for Roma residents, primarily living in the Govanhill area of south Glasgow.

1. P5 Roma Employability Support Programme

This project was implemented by the Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG) Agency, with a budget of about £400,000 provided by Glasgow city council and the European Structural Fund. The project has been running from 2012.

The project provides a range of services to help the Roma population gain access to employment. It is devised as a one-stop-shop to encourage access to mainstream employability service provision that will enable Roma to capitalise on training and employment opportunities and assist them in competing for work in the Glasgow labour market. By participating in P5, clients are able to fulfil the 'actively seeking work' requirement for receiving social benefits.

The project takes an individualised approach whereby three employability advisors and one advocacy advisor, employed by JBG, take each client through an employability pathway specific to them. Clients are encouraged to take part in various activities from developing a CV to job search and interview technique support so that they may enter into suitable and sustainable training and employment opportunities.

Clients can also access a variety of other services in addition to employability support, for example Youth Employment Service (YES), business start-up advice, bridging services, , adult literacy and numeracy (ALN) and childcare support.

The support provided assists people from the Roma community in:

- making choices about how they access and receive services

- asserting and securing their rights
- understanding procedures and policies and representing their views
- playing a more active role in the community
- progressing toward employment.

JBG also provide a one-to-one job broker service where clients can receive help in matching their profiles to existing vacancies and employers.

2. Govanhill Backcourts Initiative

This project was delivered by the Govanhill Housing Association, which is part of the Govanhill Community Development Trust, with a total budget of £1.35 million provided by Glasgow city council and the Scottish government. This was part of a wider employability and environmental improvement project to renovate the backcourts of four tenement quadrants, which had been left neglected. The project offered training and paid employment to participants from the community, including Roma as one of its priorities.

Participants in the Backcourts Initiative received a four-week training course in construction skills, during which time they continued to receive social benefits. Trainees then began a 13 week paid placement, during which they received the minimum wage. This placement saw participants receive training in soft and hard landscaping and complete a horticultural training programme. They also got work experience with contractors delivering improvements in the backcourts, as well as with other employers across Glasgow.

Roma participants in the project received support to develop their English through an ESOL programme and could access employability support through the P5 initiative.

3. Clean Green Initiative

This 12week project supported a group of Roma in gaining training and employability support, through volunteering, to complete a programme of street cleaning, refuse pick up and tree planting in Govanhill.

The pilot 'Clean Green Team' consisted of a group of 10 local Czech and Slovak Roma. The programme was delivered in partnership with Oxfam and the Govanhill Housing Association in 2012. The budget was approximately £12,000, provided by the partners

Members of the team volunteered for 25 hours each week and spent 15 hours delivering local clean up and planting services. The group spent the rest of their time receiving support from Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG) to develop employability skills and to tackle barriers to employment, while also receiving language training.

Over the 12-week period the group was involved in street sweeping, litter collection and removing bulk waste. They also supported a local environmental group, primary school and the Govanhill residents group in a project to improve front gardensThe group was involved in planting around £8,000 worth of trees, which were made available through Oxfam's Unwrapped programme. The team also distributed translated leaflets to several hundred local Czech and Roma households in an effort to raise awareness of waste and recycling among the wider community.

The three projects being reviewed form part of the 'Glasgow Roma-Net Local Action Plan for Roma'¹. At the time of the peer review, two of the projects had concluded and one was in the last phase of implementation. The extension of the Govanhill Backcourts Initiative was due to take place as was the renewal of the P5 Roma Employability Support Programme.

¹ http://urbact.eu/fileadmin/Projects/Roma_Net/documents_media/RomaNetLAP_March13.pdf

3. BENCHMARKING ROMA EMPLOYABILITY PROJECTS IN GLASGOW

This part of the report presents the peer assessment of Glasgow's approach to Roma employability schemes. The benchmark is based on seven key factors (in **bold**) that have been explored as questions for peer discussion. The information gathered and assessments made during the peer review are presented under each key factor highlighting the elements of success and the challenges of each. The overall results for Glasgow are summarised in section 5.

3.1 Relevance

Is there a good fit with the policy environment, based on identified needs and meeting labour market demand?

Elements of success:

- Glasgow city council has a long history of successfully implementing employment and training for excluded and disadvantaged groups.
- All three projects are included in Glasgow's wider political commitment to Roma inclusion which supports labour market inclusion policies.
- The projects are incorporated into the employment section of Glasgow's Local Action Plan for Roma. The plan recognises the need to address the explicit challenges of the Roma community such as language tuition, work experience and support with accessing mainstream services for employment and education.
- Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG), has wide-reaching experience and knowledge of the local labour market, including needs of local employers.

Challenges:

- When the projects were created the labour market needs of the main target group (the local Roma population) were not sufficiently known or understood.

3.2 Project design

Is there a clear goal and purpose, as well as objectives? Is the project designed in partnership with stakeholders and useful in overcoming known barriers to employment?

Elements of success:

- Both the P5 Roma Employability support programme and Govanhill Backcourts initiative were designed within the framework of the existing JBG structure of training, capacity building and employability support.
- These projects focused on skills development and not solely labour-market insertion.
- The three projects have built links and synergies to complement their activities. For example, JBG continues to support graduates of the Backcourts initiative through the P5 Employability project.
- Romano Lav - a Roma group - was involved in the conception and design of the CleanGreen initiative.
- The Backcourts initiative engaged a dedicated media worker to develop positive messages and counter misconceptions.

- A flexible project design enabled the projects to adapt to needs and changes as they were identified at a later stage in the project.

Challenges:

- There was no needs-assessment done on the particular needs and barriers of the Roma community in the project design, for example specific measures to encourage people away from the informal labour market.
- Time constraints on preparing proposals had an impact on the quality of the projects design.
- Not enough time was invested in consulting with the target group or understanding the context in which the projects operate.
- The project design does not address other pre-existing factors that prevent Roma from seeking employment or competing for jobs, for example their living arrangements and legal status.
- Involvement of other UK employment services and the UK employability training programme are missing from the project design.

3.3 Budget

Is the budget sufficient to cover the project activities and duration? Is there good value for money? Are the funding sources sustainable?

Elements of success:

- The budget of all three projects is sufficient to cover activities.

Challenges:

- Projects did not allocate enough funds for language interpretation but managed to address this and adjust to the needs.
- There was no budget for core staff, the city had to draw on various human resources budgets to sustain staffing levels and deliver proposed targeted services .

3.4 Efficiency

Is the project implemented by an organisation with the right skills for the target group? Was time, effort and cost well used for the intended objectives of the project?

Elements of success:

- The P5 Roma Employability support programme was implemented by Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG), an agency created in 2011 to support residents to compete for employment.
- JBG has experience with employability and a sound knowledge of the labour market. Staff are well experienced in serving the community and have an ample understanding of the job market.
- The partnership approach ensured that projects are implemented with as many relevant stakeholders as possible. Service providers from other policy fields, e.g. legal aid, are involved when people are referred on. NGOs and charity organisations are involved where needed and Roma communities are beginning to have a stake in the implementation of new projects.

Challenges:

- Roma organisations or communities were not originally engaged in the service delivery model. Since then, JBG have employed some Roma (including graduates of the P5 project) to act as interpreters and bridge builders.
- The language training component of the Backcourts initiative had to be significantly adapted to circumstances such as lack of formal schooling and literacy skills of the Roma community involved in the project.

3.5 Effectiveness

Does the project engage and attract the target group? What were the results and did it improve employability?

Elements of success:

- The project has built on the experience of past employability programmes in the city targeting both majority and ethnic minority populations.
- The P5 employability project managed to obtain clients through referral from other services and word-of-mouth given the difficulty in reaching the target group.

Challenges:

- Projects placed an emphasis on long-term sustainable employment as a measure of success, whereas flexible job opportunities are also a significant indicator of success.
- The specific situation and lifestyle of Roma (for example in some instances the preference for temporary work, staying close to the community, lower interest in gaining long-term employment) were not taken into account in the project implementation .
- People covered by the UK employability training programme cannot access P5 support services and have been turned away to avoid the risk of having people supported by two different programmes.

3.6 Outcomes/Impact

Does the project achieve long-term results (e.g. effect on family life and well-being of Roma)? Does it connect with other policy areas?

Elements of success:

- Roma interviewees who benefited from the P5 employability project signalled that participation in this project has made a difference to their lives. It has also had a positive impact on the lives of their other family members, and it has given them skills to better deal with day to day life, such as language skills, knowledge of existing services and how to deal with schools, housing problems and health care providers.
- Project partners took a holistic approach, seeking to address overall inclusion beyond employability.
- The media worker at the Backcourts initiative worked with local media to raise awareness of the situation of Roma on issues such as housing conditions and exploitation. This has helped to provide a positive image of Roma in the community, which is a precondition for a successful outcome.

3.7 Sustainability

Did the target group continue in employment? Were activities continued or mainstreamed? Did the project generate good practice examples?

Elements of success:

- The CleanGreen initiative was sustained through the Backcourts initiative.
- The Backcourts initiative has received approval for another phase of implementation.
- Graduates of the Backcourts initiative received support from the P5 project.
- The P5 project was extended until December 2013.
- The ultimate aim of the P5 project is to mainstream Roma services into its work on employability.

4. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

4.1 The wider approach to Roma inclusion

The peer review found an impressive level of commitment and dedication to welcoming new Roma communities to Glasgow. The approach of the city goes beyond symbolic measures to make a marked improvement in the lives of its population, regardless of their origin. Peers found some excellent practices, high aspirations and major achievements in Glasgow, marking the city out as a leading example of political commitment, innovative plans and strategy in the field of Roma inclusion.

Glasgow as a leader for Roma inclusion in Europe

The city's leadership and administration sends out a strong signal that they welcome Roma and see the population as an asset and not a burden.

The city has developed some leading examples of approaches and projects that serve as a source of inspiration to other European cities. The P5 Roma Employability Support Programme, the CleanGreen Initiative and the Govanhill Backcourts initiative, which were the basis of this peer review, constitute three such examples. The P5 project has helped nine people move into employment with two, at the time of the review, on their way to reaching six months of continued employment. The CleanGreen initiative provided a good bridge to the Backcourts initiative, with six out of 10 volunteers moving into temporary employment.

Integrated approach to employability

Glasgow has acknowledged that in order to address employability, it is necessary to address the issue of wider inclusion, beyond simply training for work.

Its projects are built around a concern for the well-being of Roma and the overall population. This has helped bridge the gap between Roma and non-Roma communities in the Govanhill neighbourhood. Projects are not seen as one-off but as part of an effort to mainstream social service delivery, a way to target ethnic minorities like Roma and help them access mainstream services in the long term.

Good cooperation among local actors and decision-makers

Glasgow places high value on partnership and this is an invaluable asset to its work on Roma inclusion.

Cooperation takes place with a wide range of stakeholders, from local charities and regional government to employers, NGOs, media, civil society and some Roma community organisations. These partnerships also take different forms such as joint projects, funding and contracting, as well as consultation and dissemination of city actions.

All projects have been a learning experience for partners and the Roma community on access to employment and government services.

An innovative approach in responding to needs

Glasgow and the project partners (Jobs & Business Glasgow, Community Development Trust) have shown great willingness to learn from experience and change methods when needed.

The city inspires a working culture where experimentation can take place and social innovation has therefore been able to thrive in the area of Roma employability.

4.2 Recommendations for developing Glasgow's approach to employability of Roma

1. Involve Roma more in design and implementation

- The trust built up with Roma communities throughout the first phase of the reviewed projects should be capitalised on to liaise with and engage Roma in the next phase of the projects.
- Attention should be paid to barriers to involvement such as language, timelines and use of welcoming language.
- In order to build the capacity and engagement of Roma communities, Glasgow should invest in and support Roma-led organisations. This has proven to be a useful approach in other cities such as Gothenburg, where a Roma council has been established and supported by the city to involve Roma in decision-making.
- The city should use alternative channels, such as social media, to reach out to Roma communities.
- The ultimate aim should be to mainstream work with Roma. Recruiting Roma staff where possible in the city and partner organisations would send out a positive signal and they can serve as role models for the community.

2. Reassess employability methods and aims

It is clear that Glasgow has had a positive experience implementing employability projects that serve the majority and some minority populations. However, the situation of Roma may be specific enough to warrant an explicit approach with different aims and values.

- Assess the success of the projects beyond the use of employment statistics but also in how it addresses the needs of the Roma outside of employment.
- Any community pressures and expectations should be noted as they can have a determining impact on the project outcomes.
- Think creatively and develop innovative methods for projects. For example, think about incorporating skills associated with informal learning and temporary work into training and capacity-building.

3. Better address the employability-employment gap

If it reconsiders its method, the city of Glasgow could provide skills for people to access the job they want. In order to do so:

- The interests and requirements of the Roma community (for example their preference for short-term or part-time work, knowledge of language, or their need for child care) should be an important consideration in matching them to a job.
- Glasgow should consider involving companies as partners in the project development. If they are involved in the development of the aims, they are more likely to see the project as matching their needs.
- The language barriers should be addressed and language courses provided that do not

presume literacy or academic knowledge in a previous language.

- Stronger support should be given to gaining self-employment and social enterprise skills. Glasgow may want to consider looking at micro-credit schemes that can be supported through EU funds.
- The UK employment services should be more involved and there should be a coordination of efforts to ensure a holistic approach among levels of government and recipients of state benefits.

4. Rethink duration / geographic reach of projects

All three projects were implemented in the Govanhill area as this is the neighbourhood where the majority of Glasgow Roma are living. However, the peer review team felt that a broader strategy regarding Roma across Glasgow may yield higher participation and better results. Other recommendations include:

- Taking a step-by-step approach along the path to employability to ensure all pre-conditions to being ready for employment are met (for example addressing living situation and legal status of the target group).
- More mid-term to long-term planning in order to set realistic deliverables and address the environmental conditions.

5. Avoid 'indicator trap' by looking at soft indicators

The peers found that the evaluation data provided in the self-assessments did not accurately reflect the impact of the projects and, in fact, the data undermined some important achievements in terms of the broader impact of the projects. As such, it is recommended that:

- Indicators should be developed to look at the broader impact, beyond numbers of people that get into jobs. For example, changes in an individual's and families status as a means to measure progress.
- The use of methods of evaluation should consider including soft indicators on social impact.
- More detailed data should be collected from target groups to monitor development and impact.

6. Disseminate projects and good practices

One project incorporated a media officer to 'spread the word' about the positive role of Roma. Yet, it was felt that the city could do more to disseminate its experience and promote positive elements of its work within the city and beyond - to other local authorities in Scotland, the UK and Europe.

Glasgow is in a position to send strong positive signals and examples to cities and take a leadership role in the European landscape, in contrast to national discourse in the UK on Roma inclusion. Its experience can serve as an inspiration but in order to do so people need to hear about it.

ANNEX I: METHODOLOGICAL NOTE AND WIDER POLICY CONTEXT IN GLASGOW

About peer reviews and benchmarks

Peer reviews are analytical tools that have been used in several EUROCITIES projects. Their logic is simple: colleagues working on similar subjects but in different cities or contexts meet and evaluate each other's projects or policies. In doing so, they learn about how others tackle similar situations, shedding new lights on their own work. Peer reviewing is common practice in research and public policy (e.g. OECD, EU institutions).

EUROCITIES peer reviews use a benchmark as a reference to evaluate a policy under review. The benchmark consists of several elements or key factors that describe what a successful policy should look like, without being too prescriptive about how exactly it should be done.

A preliminary discussion on labour market integration took place among EUROCITIES Roma Task Force members at a meeting on 7 November 2012. This discussion set the basis for the theme and framework of the peer review. The benchmark used as an assessment guideline for this peer review broadly followed the structure of the OECD Development Assistance Committee (DAC) principles of: relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, impact and sustainability². These were tailored to reflect good practice in the implementation of employment and training projects for Roma communities.

The peer review visit in Glasgow

The peer review visit took place on 18-19 June 2013 in Glasgow. The team of peers included 20 representatives from members of the EUROCITIES taskforce on Roma inclusion (**Belfast, Budapest, Ghent, Gothenburg, Munich, Turin and Vantaa**), representatives of the city of Arad and Michalovce region in Slovakia, the EUROCITIES Brussels office, the European Foundation Centre, the Open Society Foundations (OSF) and country coordinators for Bulgaria, Romania and Slovakia from the Mayors Making the Most of EU Funds programme of OSF (MERI).

The programme consisted of:

- A brainstorm session to set the context and investigate self-assessment of the projects conducted by Jobs and Business Glasgow and the Govanhill Housing Association.
- Visits to Govanhill district and Backcourts
- Visits to Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG) base Samaritan house, Govanhill, Glasgow
- Interviews with representatives of Glasgow city council, Jobs and Business Glasgow (JBG) staff, implementing partners, Roma NGOs, clients of the JBG Roma project, and staff of the JBG Roma project.

The programme ended with a workshop in which the preliminary results of the different groups were collected and discussed with representatives of Glasgow city council and JBG.

² See www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/daccriteriaforevaluatingdevelopmentassistance.htm



Peers during visit to Govanhill neighbourhood

Wider policy context in Glasgow

Glasgow is the largest city in Scotland, with a population of about 600,000 inhabitants. 13% of the population is of non-White British origin and 68% of the population is of working age. Compared to the rest of Scotland and the UK, Glasgow has a higher proportion of working age population but faces higher levels of economic inactivity and higher unemployment (see table below).

Glasgow Labour Market June 2013

	Glasgow	Scotland	UK
Population	598,000	5,254,800	61,425,700
Total Working (420,300)	70.2%	65.6%	64.7%
Economically Active (284,900)	67.8%	76.9%	76.9%
Economically Inactive (132,800)	32.2	23.1	23.1
Average Weekly earnings	507	535	548
No Qualifications	15.8%	10.7%	9.7%
Total Benefits Claimants (95,980)	22.8%	16%	14.1%
Jobseekers Allowance (23,465)	5.6%	4%	3.7%
Job Density (422,000)	1	.77	.78
Jobseekers for every unfilled vacancy	7	4.1	3.8

The majority of Roma in Glasgow are recent arrivals to the city, exercising their right to free movement within the EU. The Roma families are mostly Slovakian nationals from the Michalovce district, with increasing numbers arriving from Romania. The majority of Roma live in the South-East part of Glasgow in Govanhill, a very diverse area with a long history of migration although there is some evidence of Roma staying in other parts of the city.

There are an estimated 3,000 Roma people living in the Govanhill area in Glasgow - a neighbourhood of approximately 15,000 inhabitants. 32% of the population in Govanhill is of non-white British origin and 51 languages are spoken in this area of the city. It also has the highest proportion of privately rented accommodation in the city and proportionately higher social problems (children in workless households, overcrowding, drug and alcohol-related hospital admissions) than the Scottish average. Even with Glasgow city council's recent efforts and history of social and economic inclusion policies, Roma still face high levels of poverty and social exclusion, including marginalisation from the labour market.

Although unemployment rates amongst Roma are not known because ethnic data is not collected, some reports suggest that Roma who are eligible to work under UK law have unemployment rates of over 50%. For the minority who obtain employment, it is believed to be mostly in low skilled jobs and often in the informal labour market.

As a response to the growing number of Roma coming to Glasgow, the city council is implementing a number of strategic plans and operational measures to assist Roma inclusion. Among these is the 'Glasgow Roma-Net Local Action Plan' for Roma that sets out a broad strategy and action plan for Roma integration in education, health and social care, housing and employment³. Glasgow is also participating in an range of strategic local and transnational projects.

³ See http://urbact.eu/fileadmin/Projects/Roma_Net/documents_media/RomaNetLAP_March13.pdf

ANNEX II: LESSONS FOR OTHER CITIES LOOKING TO IMPLEMENT ROMA EMPLOYABILITY SCHEMES

Essential factors for Roma employability

Apart from evaluating the Glasgow experience, the peer review was designed to actively inspire peers dealing with Roma inclusion in other European cities. The peer review highlighted several crucial points for cities that wish to run a Roma employability scheme:

1. Address structural barriers to employment:
 - remove administrative/bureaucratic barriers to employment by adapting public services to needs
 - tackle labour-market discrimination
2. Design projects with a clear needs-assessment of the labour market and the situation of Roma in employment.
 - Ghent develops a range of work-related language training courses focusing on, among others:
 - professional technical language in the workplace
 - use of language buddies
 - customised language training, simple language for technical instructors
 - communication skills needed for a job application
 - conversational exercises
3. Involve Roma communities in all phases of the project 'nothing about us without us':
 - conduct a labour market survey and identify the needs of target population
 - raise awareness among Roma groups of their rights
 - make Roma agents of their own success (for example by establishing a Roma Council)
4. Use an integrated approach:
 - involve people from different policy areas (for example housing, social services, education) and from different levels of the administration (local, regional, national)
5. Work in partnership: partnering with NGOs, agencies and employers will ensure there is wider dissemination of actions.
 - In Belfast NGOs act as intermediaries to help with paper work, entitlement, build up capacity and create leadership and role models within the community
6. Consider targeted measures for especially vulnerable groups such as women, single parents, and others, with an aim to widen mainstream measures:
 - providing day-care solutions for Roma women
 - provide tailored language courses

Challenges:

The peer review and preparatory exchanges highlighted the main barriers and challenges to developing employability projects for Roma communities in European cities. These can be divided into three groups barriers associated with individuals, labour market barriers and the challenges that projects are likely to encounter.

Barriers for individuals

- Education and language: levels of education and language skills vary widely.
- Skills: employment skills are not always relevant to the modern labour market.
- Self-confidence: some parts of the Roma community who have been marginalised lack the confidence to access the labour market.
- Vulnerability: the Roma population in many cities lives in a cycle of poverty and are easy targets for exploitation.
- Distrust: by Roma of employers and distrust by employers towards Roma workers.

External barriers/labour market obstacles

- Employment discrimination, direct and indirect, against Roma.
- Stereotypical view about the work ethics of Roma people held by majority populations.
- Limited access to the labour market (e.g. transitional arrangements on freedom of movement of workers for Bulgarians and Romanians in some member states).
- Overrepresentation of Roma in grey and informal economies (e.g. construction and factory work).
- Labour market situation (e.g. unemployment rates of overall population and the economic crisis).

Challenges for projects

- Heterogeneity: 'Roma' is not one group with similar characteristics but can be very diverse and require varying approaches.
- Lack of funds to finance projects/initiatives: often project-based and not sustainable; challenge in scaling up solutions.
- Competences: for cities, difficult to obtain change in an area that is not within their competence (e.g. labour market). National administrations and private sector play a big role.
- Integrated approach: addressing all interrelated issues including employment, housing and education in a comprehensive and sustainable way. Working with employers, national government and other service providers.
- Striking the right balance between universal service provision and targeted approaches.

Examples of tools and measures successfully implemented by cities:

- Work experience:
 - Ghent project for most at risk, places reserved for East European not only Roma one-year contract offered
 - Budapest traineeship for 40 Roma people in city and municipal institutions, including mentoring
 - European Parliament work experience for well-educated Roma youth
 - Bulgaria offering internships for Roma students in the corporate sector
 - Glasgow the Govanhill Backcourt project providing on the job work experience and training
- Employment mediators, catered training and job coaches (Ghent, Glasgow, Lille, Zagreb)
- Vocational training (Berlin, Tirana)
- Social entrepreneurship projects (in Bulgaria some municipalities have projects on, for example producing ecological honey, also giving credit with good conditions to small farms and businesses)
- Offering Roma access to municipal employment (in Bulgaria Roma are offered contracts to provide maintenance for social housing. In Budapest, the city council has participated in a project to promote employment of Roma as municipal staff)



This publication is commissioned under the European Union Programme for Employment and Social Solidarity (2007-2013). This programme is managed by the Directorate-General for Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion of the European Commission. It was established to financially support the implementation of the objectives of the European Union in the employment and social affairs area, as set out in the Social Agenda, and thereby contribute to the achievement of the EUROPE 2020 goals in these fields.

For more information see: ec.europa.eu/progress.

The information contained in this publication does not necessarily reflect the position or opinion of the European Commission.