



Integration paradigms - taking the debate forward

This discussion paper provides a brief analysis of a discussion the working group migration and integration has embarked on since 2013. The Integrating cities¹ report published by the working group in 2013 signalled a *'shift in the way migrant integration is defined in a local context. A decade ago, 'integration' was the ruling model. Today we see city policies moving towards a broader cross-cutting approach to social inclusion, participation and equal opportunities. ...'*

A discussion paper produced by Richard Stanton from MigrationWork CIC in April 2013² raised the question whether this reported change has resulted in a fundamental change in paradigm or reframing of the integration model for European cities, raising questions about the consequences this would have on the work of integration at local and European level.

Since then, the working group has undertaken a preliminary research (see Annex) to identify the basic common denominator for integration in European cities. The findings of this research demonstrated that:

- Although imperfect, 'integration' is still the ruling term used by cities to describe their work in this area. A notable exception are Dutch local authorities, although The Hague has recently gone back to using 'integration' as a policy choice to stimulate participation of migrants.
- Other terms which have become accepted in this policy area include 'citizenship', 'participation' and 'opening'
- As such, cities share some important characteristics:
 - o Integration is seen as a two-way process, and through their actions local authorities set out to reach migrants and long-established residents alike
 - o Cities apply a holistic approach to integration, focusing on key policy areas such as language, education and employment
 - o There are elements of non-discrimination and equal opportunities in the integration paradigms, although cities' actions move beyond these to actively promote inclusion and participation of migrants

There are also some differences in the way cities set out to address 'migrant integration'. These include the extent to which cities use targeted measures, how 'immigrants' are defined in their policy measures as well as understanding the responsibility of migrants as agents in their integration.

Working group members are requested to reflect upon the following questions:

- Is there a common understanding of integration across European municipalities?
- What are the structures, context and competences of these practices?
- can the local discourse have an impact on EU and national paradigms and discourses on migrant integration?

¹ http://nws.euocities.eu/MediaShell/media/IntegratingCitiesReport_Cities%20and%20migrants_%20-final.pdf

² http://nws.euocities.eu/MediaShell/media/06_background%20integration%20paradigms.pdf

Annex: Integration paradigms survey

The following table summarises responses received from 17 member cities of the working group migration and integration to the following questions:

1. What is the word used in your city to refer to ‘integration’? In original language and translation in English
2. What are the characteristics of the integration paradigms in your cities? (targets, scope)
3. Do you refer to people of migrant background (residents born abroad or children of those from abroad) as a category in developing city policy?

City	Word used for ‘integration’	Characteristics of ‘integration’	Is ‘migrant’ a category for policy?
Amsterdam	<p>Dutch: <i>‘burgerschap’</i></p> <p>English: <i>‘citizenship’</i> (of all Amsterdammers)</p> <p>‘Integration’ (of those who are new) is no longer used.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Citizenship paradigm: all Amsterdammers, whether ‘new’ or ‘old’ have to participate in society following three interrelated pillars: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. participation > participate in society (e.g. through work, education, volunteering) and taking responsibility for it. 2. social cohesion > feeling connected to each other; ensure the well-being of all members, minimising disparities and avoiding marginalisation 3. civility > respect others/tolerance, being open minded, being resilient/able to accept criticism, have/start respectful conversations about differences • No specific integration policy exists: the diversity aspect must be taken into account in all policy areas. • Hard work on combating and preventing discrimination and 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>radicalisation, barriers to participation, and investing in the emancipation of citizens.</p>	
Barcelona	<p>Catalan: '<i>integració</i>' Spanish: '<i>integración</i>' English: '<i>integration</i>'</p> <p>Word used in the context of the intercultural paradigm, aiming to foster positive interaction among all city residents, for social inclusion and cohesion.</p> <p>Another word used is <i>convivència</i> in Catalan: that means living together with through positive interaction.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Intercultural paradigm: understanding of the process of social inclusion and cohesion as aimed at all residents in all districts and neighbourhoods and in most sectors, regardless of their ethnic or cultural origin, regardless of whether they are newcomers or long-established inhabitants (quite recent strategy, in phase of consolidation) • Three strategic policy lines define public action in most areas under this paradigm: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Promoting equity (access to services and equal rights and fighting discrimination) 2. Acknowledging/Recognising cultural diversity (diversity as a positive asset for the city) 3. Fostering positive interaction among all residents. <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Very effective policy in this time of growing social unrest due to the crisis, especially hitting recent 	<p>Foreigners are referred to as 'people of migrant origin' (<i>persones d'origen immigrant</i> or <i>persones immigrades</i>, in Catalan) or even second generation, but they do not represent an official statistical category. At the local census, only measure nationality and place of birth are tracked.</p> <p>No distinction for Spanish coming from different regions (even if they account for almost 50% of total population).</p>

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		settlers and foreigners.	
Brno	<p>In Czech, the word 'integrace' for 'integration' is used, but it is derived from English.</p> <p>More native terms are 'začlenění' or 'včlenění' (both of them meaning integration and incorporation in English).</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Integration of foreigners is treated on regional level following a 4-year strategic program Implementing body for immigration policy is the South Moravian Regional Centre to Support the Integration of Foreigners, in collaboration with implementing partners (NGOs, civil society,...) Services aimed at improvement of social, legal, linguistic and cultural situation and status of foreigners in the South Moravian Region are provided (social and legal counselling, courses of Czech language, educational cycles about the issues of migration and refugees, terrain social work focused at improvement of labour market skills and capacities to achieve social and economic independence). 	<p>No.</p> <p>Data on the phenomenon is collected thanks to the European Fund for the Integration of Third-Country Nationals, which issues the 'Quarterly monitoring of situation of foreigners in the Region'.</p>
Ghent	<p>Dutch: '<i>Integratie</i>'</p> <p>English: '<i>societal integration</i>'</p> <p>or</p> <p>Dutch: '<i>Inburgering</i>'</p> <p>English: '<i>civic integration</i>'</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Inequality is better tackled making distinctions between groups Pro-active response to migration: inclusive policy to enhance social cohesion and improve equivalence; (temporary) categorial measures towards (sub)groups such as migrants, 	<p>Migration is a policy parameter.</p> <p>Migrants are differentiated from locals both from a <i>juridical</i> (nationality and residence status to determine rights and duties) and a <i>sociological</i> point of view (e.g. struggle against racism, link</p>

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>Roma, etc.; empowerment of ethnic-cultural minorities; enhancing accessibility of goods and services; actions to change mentality of local population (Flemish policy decree on integration and local policy define the process of integration explicitly)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Focus on work, education, health and housing, because of their leverage function for all other areas of life. • Symbolic abolition of the 'allochoon vs. autochtoon' definition to avoid the 'us vs. them' approach. General attention is on weakest groups, still also a focus on people that for instance do not speak the Dutch language. • Figures and data are pillars for a good and active policy and actions 	<p>between migration and poverty), but no differentiation between different migrant backgrounds.</p>
Helsinki	<p>Finnish: '<i>Kotoutuminen</i>' with double meaning:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • '<i>integration</i>', defining the personal process of the individual, in relation to the society, to obtain knowledge and skills, as well as be able to maintain his or her own language and culture. • '<i>integration by law</i>', 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 'Helsinkisation' objective: immigrants are treated equally as citizens resident of Helsinki, regardless of background/status. • Service provision is based on the "normal service principle" - no reasonable to build complex immigration specific service system, mainstreaming is the key. Immigrants are offered equal opportunities and 	<p>Mother tongue (rather than statistics about immigration on the basis of citizenship or native country or status) is the steadiest basis for statistics entries. For example, in the case of immigrants, citizenship is changed into Finnish citizenship in the course of time, whereas the native country does not extend to cover the second generation of immigrants, born in</p>

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
	<p>meaning the measures that the city and its partners and services provide to immigrants (but less and less used in the common language of the city)</p>	<p>can actively participate in the society.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Inclusive HR policy in public bodies: will to recruit qualified immigrants to the personnel and provide training equality and diversity; change from multiculturalism to diversity discourse • Partnership agreement between city and state to define roles, responsibilities, resources and objectives regarding provision of services for immigrants • Specific target groups (e.g. international students, international workers unemployed immigrants) and services defined during the strategic year 2009-2012: (e.g. equality of immigrants in housing, school drop-out prevention, employability of unemployed immigrants, Finnish courses) 	<p>Finland. HR gathers info on the employees, in 3 categories: Finnish, Swedish or "other" language speaker.</p> <p>Mainstreaming of policy, no immigration specific service system.</p>
Leipzig	<p>German: 'Integration (der Migranten)' English: 'integration (of the migrants)'</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Integration as a two-way process: integration readiness and integration efforts of migrants on the one hand and integration openness and welcoming culture of the host society on the other • Integration policy (as social policy) has the overall goal to promote equal participation of migrants in the 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		economic, social, political and cultural life and to take advantage of the productive use of their abilities and potentials.	
Malmo	In English, the word 'integration' is used.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Action plan for integration adopted by the Integration Council in 1999, which states a number of goals concerning youth, promotion of jobs and employment, efforts against discrimination and racism. Completed with a plan against discrimination that was adopted by the City Council in 2010. • Current paradigm is mainstreaming: every department has a responsibility to work towards achieving the goals in the action plan. 	
Milan	Italian: 'integrazione/incontro' English: 'integration/culture matching'	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Main goal is to reach social justice and to give the opportunity to the citizens (migrants and non migrants) to play a central role, but also to take their own responsibility towards their rights and duties. • The word integration has been used in Milan strategic papers referred to the need of working and thinking together, in order to create inclusion, 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		trust and protection for all.	
Munich	<p>Both in German and in English, the term 'Integration' is used, although there is a debate in process.</p> <p>Integration has been explicitly defined as 'the long-term process that immigrants go through to become involved in the mainstream of society and bond with others in the community to achieve equal opportunities'.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Intercultural Integration Concept: intercultural aspects are taken into consideration in all municipal decisions, projects, plans and services. • Intercultural Integration stands for recognition of free and democratic standards and equal access to all services • Involvement of every citizen in the process of intercultural integration • Socio-geographical mix in all sections of the community must be promoted, including political participation • Language skills in both German and a person's native language are key assets • Institutions have to adopt a policy of intercultural orientation and intercultural mainstreaming • Decisive action to combat discrimination and racism has to be taken • Integration must have something specific to offer to each target group 	
Nantes	French: ' intégration ', meaning an interactive process between newcomers	The city has elaborated a comprehensive approach to integration, called ' Egalité	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
	<p>and the welcoming society.</p> <p>Many steps along the way to integration: welcoming/hospitality policy, access to rights and then concrete integration, achieved via education, French learning...</p> <p>English : 'hospitality', 'access to law', 'intégration', 'equality', 'citizenship'</p>	<p>Intégration Citoyenneté', based on three pillars of equality:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Formal equality: policy action in this sense is oriented towards hospitality and welcoming of newcomers, access to rights and reduction of obstacles to inclusion (learning of French, access to education and employment) • Equality of treatment (non-discrimination policy): action to fight discrimination and different treatment in every field of life • Equality of opportunities (positive diversity policy): actions to empower foreigners to take part in city life, facilitate access to services, promote existing opportunities. <p>Main problems experienced in the work on integration:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Coordination with different level of governance is often hard (especially with the State level on French learning and recognition of foreign degrees) • Funding and resources from the State are not sufficient to cover all needs 	
Nuremberg	English: 'integration' and 'intercultural opening'	Nuremberg Integration Program: overall goals are equal participation of every citizen in all benefits/measures of the city and equal	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
	<p>German: 'Integration' and 'Interkulturelle Öffnung'.</p> <p>Between 2002 and 2011, the city just used 'integration' defined as a mutual process (= target groups are people with as well as without migration background; integration concerns everyone, everybody has to contribute to it).</p> <p>But realising society does neither have a differentiated nor a positive understanding of the word, since 2012 the city also uses the word "intercultural opening" (meaning that institutions like the city governments, schools, welfare organizations, enterprises and so on as well as the "society" itself (especially people without migration background) has to open up to the idea that people with migration background are by now also a part of our society and therefore have to get employed (in good positions), that their needs, backgrounds and potentials are kept in mind when developing new measures/checking old ones and so on).</p> <p>Internal debate is in progress.</p>	<p>chances of fruition of one's goals, plans, ideas - no matter the ethnic or social background.</p> <p>Main guidelines to steer integration policy:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • integration is mainstreamed across all administrative departments (internal HR included) • Policies are oriented on all migrants as such, who will have their life focus in Leipzig for any length of time, disregarding their immigration status (both new arrivals and long stayers) • Municipal approach to integration consisting of four elements: linguistic integration, social integration, professional integration, social counselling and support. Language support, in this context, is considered an essential and necessary, but not a sufficient tool of integration policies. • Integration not as one-sided goal to be achieved by migrants; but challenging all people living in a city to contribute to an approach between people. Mutual acceptance and tolerance as well as inter-cultural dialogue are promoted. • If necessary, existing programs can be changed in order to include target 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>groups, taking into account the diversity of the migrant population.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Private citizens', associations' and clubs' initiatives concerned with integration measures are to be supported. • Refusal of any kind of racism and discrimination. • Lobbying with the State [of Bavaria] and the Federal Republic for sustainable political and social participation of all [resident] foreigners. 	
Oslo	<p>The word most frequently used in Oslo (amongst the population in general) is still '<i>integrering</i>' ('<i>integration</i>').</p> <p>However, '<i>mangfold</i>' ('<i>diversity</i>') is also often used and is spreading as a term for indicating the benefits for including and widening the concept of the wider Norwegian society. (The "problem" related to this concept is that in Norwegian this word is used in many different areas of society indicating for instance: a variety of methods, tools or means.) in newspapers and certainly among professionals, diversity is the most used term.</p>	<p>Integration paradigms of Oslo has been concentrating on inclusion of minorities in worklife since 2011. It was done following the principles of the Integrating Cities Charter.</p> <p>The charter is the baseline for the City Council Decision on "Diversity - a city for all about OXLO Oslo Xtra Large" 50/2013 (adopted on May 15,2013).</p> <p>The main paradigms are related to:</p> <p>* developing OXLO campaign in general, the city of Oslo's long-term awareness-raising campaign to promote the capital as a city of inclusion and tolerance</p>	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
	<p>In the city of Oslo the office underlying our Department is called Office for Diversity and Integration.</p> <p>Some would also use the word 'inkludering' ('inclusion'). Again - this term is often used in other areas of society and is not exclusive for the integration field. As such it can be used to indicate social inclusion, the inclusion of "others" being f.i. handicapped mentally or physically and of different sexual orientation.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> * making it more known to the public * counteracting discrimination, especially travelling Romas. 	
Riga	<p>Latvian: '<i>sabiedrības integrācija</i>'</p> <p>English: '<i>society integration</i>'</p>	<p>Riga City Society Integration Programme, part of the multi-year strategic programme, is based on the idea that integration is a dynamic, two-way process of mutual understanding, in which all members of the society participate as equal partners and have the possibility to work constructively, intercultural contacts are encouraged and equality is promoted. This process includes all spheres of life -economic, social, cultural and political. The diversity of society is emphasized as richness, not a threat.</p> <p>Framework of the Programme:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotion of participation and access to information in the municipality 	<p>Terminological ambiguity:</p> <p>The term 'immigrant' is not defined in Latvian legal acts, but mostly used in the political discourse. According to the legal acts, the following terms are used:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foreigner - a person who is not a Latvian citizen of Latvia; • Union citizen - a foreigner who has the citizenship of any of the European Union Member States, Member State of the European Economic Area and the Swiss

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Promotion of access to education, culture, sports and hobby education • Promotion of social inclusion through the Development of intercultural dialogue, • Promotion of tolerance and integration • Prevention of discrimination. <p>Some concrete examples:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ Project competitions aimed at the promotion of integration - for NGOs and Riga City institutions ▪ Riga City Advisory Board on Society Integration Issues - established at the end of 2010, consists of 12 NGOs representatives, including 4 national minority NGOs and 11 City Council representatives, including politicians and employees, meet quarterly. ▪ Latvian Language courses for the inhabitants of Riga - since 2011 supported 30 projects with the total amount of 258 000 Ls and the opportunity to improve their knowledge of Latvian was for 4000 inhabitants. ▪ Citizens Forum - conducted on a 	<p>Confederation;</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Third country - any state, except of any of the European Union Member States, Member State of the European Economic Area or the Swiss Confederation. • Non-citizens-those citizens of the former USSR or their children, residing in Latvia, who are not or have not been citizens of Latvia or any other country (abridged)

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>regular basis since 2010, each year brings together more than 200 inhabitants, including national minorities, the following topics are tackled - participation, society uniting activities, etc.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ 46 bilingual schools and 6 national minority schools ▪ Participation in international projects for integration 	
Rotterdam	<p>English: '<i>participation</i>', '<i>citizenship</i>'</p> <p>Abolition of the word 'integration' fostering the 'we-against-them mentality'.</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Principle of Citizenship: policy aimed at the participation of all citizens of Rotterdam. Non-participation is seen as a general problem, ethnic background may be one of the causes. • Citizenship policy focuses on only a few themes: Combating discrimination, Emancipation (including emancipation of homosexuals, Diversity as an asset, Non-formal education Preserving knowledge and expertise through knowledge centres. • Knowledge centres, mainly 2nd line, making knowledge available to the 1st line professionals 	
The Hague	'Integration'	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Language acquisition, - labour market integration (vocational 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>training or job seeking) - Participation (through volunteer work or similar)</p> <p>Before 2010, the term of choice was 'citizenship' but a decision by a new council to go back to integration was done to stimulate participation of new groups in the city.</p>	
Vienna	<p>German: <i>'Integrations- und Diversitätspolitik'</i>, <i>'integrationsorientierte Diversitätspolitik'</i></p> <p>English: <i>'Integration and diversity policies'</i> or also <i>'integration-oriented diversity policies'</i>.</p>	<p>Change of paradigm in 2004: competence shifted from Vienna Integration Fund (established outside of the administration) to an internal Department for Integration and Diversity Affairs.</p> <p>The topic was transferred internally within the administration to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • change the political discourse and attitudes from deficit orientation (what do immigrants need, what do they need to do and learn to adapt to their new society?) towards the values and assets and added value of a diverse society • accept migration as a normality and praise diverse backgrounds, competencies and multilingual skills 	

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>as assets (diverse municipality HR)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • inclusion of immigrants become a competence of the whole administration, an issue that is cutting across all sectors of administration (Querschnittsmaterie). • opening the structures and institutions of society and make them adapt to the needs and assets of an ethnically and culturally diverse society • diversity management measures to guarantee equal access to all services for all inhabitants and support in all spheres of life (learning the German language, access to labour market, education and social system, housing and political participation) • promotion of peaceful and respectful climate of cohabitation, preventing conflicts, learning from each other, intercultural and interreligious dialogue. 	
Zurich	<p>German: 'Integration' and 'Integrationsförderung'</p> <p>English: 'integration' and 'promoting integration'</p> <p>Since 'integration' is a well-established</p>	<p>Integration happens mainly in the so-called 'regular structures' (school, work, public administration etc.). In other words, the city offers their services to the entire population. They are designed to the needs of locals as well as new residents from abroad. If</p>	<p>We refer to three categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Foreigners (30% of the city's population) • Foreign born (40% of the city's population) • People of migrant

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
	<p>and legal term in Switzerland, it is not an issue to change it in the near future for practical reasons. We are aware that the term has acquired problematic connotations in the current debate. But presumably, any term - also new terms - will become controversial sooner or later. Therefore, for the time being, we rather concentrate on professional and meaningful work instead of launching a conceptual debate.</p> <p>The official translation of 'Integrationsförderung Stadt Zürich' is 'Office for Cross-Cultural Issues of the City of Zurich'.</p>	<p>necessary, special integration measures for foreigners are established, such as language acquisition or information events and services for newcomers.</p> <p>Main targets:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Enhancing equal opportunities All members of society shall profit equally from the offers and services of the city. The services are designed to the effect that they reach all segments of society (target-oriented communication, if necessary in different languages) • Enabling personal responsibility The city supports language and social skills which are necessary to cope with daily life and work. • Establishing a culture of welcome The city welcomes new residents with a welcome event (in different languages), informs them about integration support services and provides them with important general information. The city values different traditions and religions and asserts their place in society. • Living together The city supports activities which brings different people together and which contribute to their mutual 	<p>background (born abroad or at least one parent born abroad, 60% of the city's population)</p> <p>In Switzerland demographic statistics rely on nationality, therefore the category 'foreigners' is predominant and mostly referred to. The consequences of some new developments in national data are open.</p>

City	Word used for 'integration'	Characteristics of 'integration'	Is 'migrant' a category for policy?
		<p>understanding. The city also invites different groups and communities to participate in shaping the city.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Facing challenges The City of Zurich is attentive to emerging problems with integration, acts at an early stage and tries to find sustainable solutions. • Taking an active political stand Zurich is known for its active, pragmatic, and seminal work in questions of integration and migration. It is member of various national and international professional networks in order to discuss and develop integration measures. The office of integration gives opinions and statements for political discussions and the legislative process. Also, conferences and discussion platforms are organized to engage public debates on integration. 	